## Moody's

ANALYTICS

```
ANALYSIS
FEBRUARY 24, 2022
```

Prepared by
Bernard Yaros
Bernard.YarosJr@moodys.com
Assistant Director
Jesse Rogers
Jesse.Rogers@moodys.com
Assistant Director
Ross Cioffi
Ross.Cioffi@moodys.com
Economist
Mark Zandi
Mark.Zandi@moodys.com
Chief Economist

Contact Us

Email
help@economy.com
U.S./Canada
+1.866.275.3266

EMEA
+44.20.7772.5454 (London)
+420.224.222.929 (Prague)

Asia/Pacific
+852.3551.3077

All Others
+1.610.235.5299

Web
www.economy.com
www.moodysanalytics.com

# Global Fiscal Policy in the Pandemic 

## Introduction

The U.S. and global economies have recovered surprisingly quickly from the debilitating COVID-19 pandemic. Two years after the pandemic first struck, much of the world has recovered the output and employment lost during the severe recession suffered at the start of the pandemic and is well on the way to returning to full employment. This strong performance is due in significant part to the vaccines and other therapies rapidly developed to fight the virus, but also to the quick and massive global monetary and fiscal policy response.

## Global Fiscal Policy in the Pandemic

The U.S. and global economies have recovered surprisingly quickly from the debilitating COVID-19 pandemic. Two years after the pandemic first struck, much of the world has recovered the output and employment lost during the severe recession suffered at the start of the pandemic and is well on the way to returning to full employment. This strong performance is due in significant part to the vaccines and other therapies rapidly developed to fight the virus, but also to the quick and massive global monetary and fiscal policy response.

In this paper, we focus on the contribution of the global fiscal policy response to the pandemic. We use the Moody's Analytics Global Macroeconomic Model to construct a counterfactual scenario in which governments in the world's 10 largest economies-accounting for more than two-thirds of global GDP—do not provide economic support to households and businesses during the pandemic (see Chart 1). We compare this counterfactual scenario to our baseline, most likely, scenario, which includes the macroeconomic impact of fiscal policies implemented by governments.

## Chart 1: Governments Step Up

Fiscal support during COVID-19 pandemic, \% of 2019 GDP


Source: Moody's Analytics

The macroeconomic consequences of governments failing to help their economies during the pandemic would have been devastating. Global real GDP would have fallen twice as much in 2020, and while the economy would have begun to recover in 2021, growth would have been half of what it actually was (see Chart 2). There would have been 40 million additional unemployed
workers in 2021 and stubbornly high joblessness thereafter (see Chart 3). And the global economy would forever be diminished, never fully recovering the output lost during the pandemic. ${ }^{1}$

## Chart 2: Deeper Fall, Weaker Recovery

Global real GDP, 2012\$ tril, SAAR


Source: Moody's Analytics

## Chart 3: Severe Contractions Everywhere

Peak impact on real GDP, \%


Source: Moody's Analytics

## What if?

The counterfactual scenario we have constructed assumes national governments never implemented the emergency discretionary fiscal measures they have actually put in place since the pandemic hit at the start of 2020. This includes a wide range of policies that broadly encompass

[^0]transfer payments to households and businesses, tax cuts, aid to subnational governments, and public infrastructure and other direct spending.

To quantify this counterfactual scenario, we have simulated the Moody's Analytics Global Macroeconomic Model. ${ }^{2}$ The model links more than 70 countries through international trade, global financial markets, exchange rates, consumer sentiment, and capital flows. The model is simulated assuming an absence of fiscal support for each country by itself, and for all 10 countries at once. By so doing, we are able to determine the spillover effects from one country's policies on the rest of the world. Nearly half the countries benefited more from fiscal support provided by other countries than they did from their own fiscal support (see Chart 4).

## Chart 4: Fiscal Policy Knows No Borders

Cumulative real GDP impact, \% of GDP, 2020-2024


Source: Moody's Analytics

We make several simplifying assumptions in these simulations. First, we assume the course of the pandemic and the development and rollout of vaccines proceeded as they did. Second, monetary policy is determined endogenously in the model. That is, global central banks set interest rate and balance sheet policies based on their reaction functions that account for the economy's performance, inflation, inflation expectations, and financial conditions. ${ }^{3}$ Finally, we restrict the scope of fiscal measures to include only those that explicitly address the fallout from the pandemic. ${ }^{4}$

## United States

No other nation responded more aggressively to the pandemic than the U.S. (see Table 1). In total, the fiscal support was well over $\$ 5$ trillion, equal to nearly $25 \%$ of GDP. This compares with less

[^1]Table 1: U.S. Fiscal Response to COVID-19

| Legislation | Actions | \$ bil |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Coronavirus Preparedness and Response <br> Supplemental Appropriations Act | Funding for healthcare agencies and testing, funding for vaccine and other therapies across various <br> agencies, subsidized SME loans. | 8.3 |
| Families First Coronavirus Response Act | Tax credits to firms for COVID-19-related paid sick leave and paid family medical leave; food assis- <br> tance via Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program and Special Supplemental Nutrition Program <br> for Women, Infants, and Children; federal assistance for increased state unemployment insurance <br> benefits; expand Medicare and Medicaid coverage to COVID-19 tests. | 192.0 |
| Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic | Household cash transfers, federal assistance to expand state unemployment insurance benefits, <br> grant-convertible loans to SMEs under the Paycheck Protection Program, grants to states and munic- <br> ipalities via $\$ 150$ bil Coronavirus Relief Fund, student loan deferrals, expand Medicaid coverage to <br> telehealth services, various tax deferrals and credits. | $1,756.0$ |
| Security Act | Addition of $\$ 320$ bil to Paycheck Protection Program, loans to smaller financial institutions, grants <br> for hospitals, additional funding for states/municipalities for COVID-19 testing. | 484.0 |
| Paycheck Protection Program and Health |  |  |
| Care Enhancement Act | Extension of plus-up to federal unemployment insurance benefits amounting to $\$ 300$ per week, with <br> an additional $\$ 100$ to be provided by states. Additional executive orders extend student loan deferral <br> for loans held by Department of Education, declare temporary payroll tax holiday, instruct govern- <br> ment agencies to assist renters and homeowners with eviction orders. | 174.0 |

Sources: CBO, CRFB, JCT, Moody's Analytics
than $18 \%$ of GDP in the U.K., the country that provided the next most fiscal support, and the approximately $10 \%$ of GDP provided by all countries across the globe on average.

The unrivaled U.S. fiscal response was motivated in part by the nation's meaningfully weaker automatic fiscal stabilizers-tax and spending policies that automatically counteract declines in economic activity without direct action by lawmakers-compared with those in other advanced economies. ${ }^{5}$ It was likely also motivated by lessons learned during the financial crisis a little over a decade ago, when the policy response was slower in coming and much smaller, contributing to what was a painfully slow economic recovery. ${ }^{67}$

The U.S. economy's rapid recovery was due to not just the scale of the fiscal support by fiscal policymakers but also how quickly they responded to the pandemic. The pandemic slammed the U.S. in February 2020, the massive CARES Act was passed into law in late March, and no more than one month later over \$1 trillion in fiscal support was already disbursed to households and businesses.

[^2]There was a similar ramp-up in fiscal support in early 2021, largely via the American Rescue Plan, which was passed into law in March 2021 (see Chart 5).

## Chart 5: Rapid Ramp-Up in U.S. Support

Cumulative U.S. pandemic relief, $\$$ tril


Sources: BEA, CRFB, HHS, SBA, U.S. Treasury, Moody's Analytics

In the counterfactual scenario where this fiscal support was not provided, real GDP falls by a stunning $11 \%$ in calendar 2020, more than three times its actual decline. The economy would have also succumbed to a double-dip recession in early 2021 (see Chart 6). A recovery begins in earnest in the second half of 2021, but even then, the economy never fully returns to its pre-pandemic path, as real GDP is permanently reduced.

## Chart 6: Double-Dip Recession in the U.S.

U.S. real GDP, 2012\$ tril, SAAR


Sources: BEA, Moody's Analytics

The impact on the U.S. job market would have been equally grim. The economy is currently on track to recoup all the jobs lost during the pandemic recession by late this year. Without government
support, this milestone would not have been achieved until summer 2026. Low-wage workers, who have suffered most financially during the pandemic, would have been set back even further, since they work in industries that have desperately needed government support during the pandemic. This includes administrative and support services, healthcare, retail trade, and leisure and hospitality (see Chart 7). The weaker job market means that unemployment remains stuck in the double digits through 2021, declines only slowly thereafter, and ultimately never returns to its pre-pandemic full-employment unemployment rate (see Chart 8). ${ }^{8}$ Moreover, with the economy operating with high unemployment for an extended period, wage growth sharply slows to an all-time low. ${ }^{9}$

## Chart 7: Low-Wage Industries Most Hurt

U.S., jobs lost without government support, mil, 2021


Sources: BEA, BLS, Moody's Analytics Note: Figures are avg industry wage in 2020. Avg for all industries was \$66K.

## Chart 8: Stubbornly High Unemployment

U.S. unemployment rate, \%, SA


Sources: BLS, Moody's Analytics

[^3]In the counterfactual scenario, inflation picks up in early 2021 as the distribution of vaccines prompts a reopening of the economy and a surge in consumer demand. However, it falls back below the Federal Reserve's inflation target by the second half of 2022. The Fed is not struggling with uncomfortably high inflation as it is now. Rather, it contends with uncomfortably low inflation, as in the decade after the financial crisis (see Chart 9).

## Chart 9: Return of Too-Low Inflation

U.S. core PCE deflator, \% change yr ago


Sources: BEA, Moody's Analytics

Household finances have benefited enormously from government support. Thanks mostly to stimulus checks, enhanced unemployment insurance, and rental and food assistance, personal incomes declined only briefly at the very start of the pandemic (see Chart 10). If households had not received this help, real disposable income would have plunged in 2020 and would not fully recover until summer 2023.

## Chart 10: Household Incomes Get Boost

U.S. personal income, \$ tril, SAAR, change from 2019Q4


Sources: BEA, U.S. Treasury, Moody's Analytics

Household wealth would also have been significantly diminished, as the Standard \& Poor's 500 stock price index would have plunged, cut in half peak to trough (see Chart 11). Consumers are dour now despite the strong economic recovery, but confidence would be at an all-time low if fiscal policymakers had not stepped up.

## Chart 11: Stock Prices Get Crushed

S\&P 500 composite, 1941-1943=10


Sources: S\&P, Moody's Analytics

## American Rescue Plan

Arguably the most controversial of the U.S. fiscal support packages was the nearly $\$ 2$ trillion American Rescue Plan that became law in March 2021. The ARP has been criticized as being too large, overstimulating an already fast-improving economy and significantly contributing to the currently uncomfortably high inflation.

This perspective is not consistent with our results. Without the ARP, the U.S. economy would have come close to suffering a double-digit recession in spring 2021. Based on a simulation of our macro model assuming no ARP, real GDP declines in the second quarter of 2021 and ekes out only a small gain in the third (see Table 2). Because of the weakened economy, unemployment rises back over $7 \%$ in summer 2021 and remains materially higher after that (see Chart 12). ${ }^{10}$

The ARP is responsible for adding well over 4 million more jobs in 2021, and the economy is currently on track to recovering all the jobs lost in the pandemic by the second quarter of this year. If there had been no ARP, it would have taken another year for the economy to recover all of these jobs.

The ARP has contributed to the acceleration in inflation by supporting increased consumer demand, but this occurred almost entirely in the first half of 2021 when higher inflation was not considered a problem (see Chart 13). Indeed, at the time it was even viewed positively, as many businesses were simply re-establishing the prices they had previously cut when the pandemic

## Chart 12: More Unemployment Without ARP

U.S. unemployment rate, \%, SA


Sources: BLS, Moody's Analytics

## Chart 13: Don’t Blame ARP For High Inflation

Consumer price inflation, annualized \% change


Sources: BLS, Moody's Analytics
caused the economy to shut down. Moreover, inflation had been much too low for comfort since the global financial crisis more than a decade earlier. The Federal Reserve and other global central banks had been struggling to lift inflation back up to their targets.

Inflation only became uncomfortably high when the Delta wave of the pandemic hit in late summer last year. This inflation was a surprise, but so too was the Delta variant, as it came immediately on the heels of the vaccine rollout and widespread optimism that the pandemic was more-orless behind us.

Delta slammed consumer demand, as it prompted renewed self-quarantining and border restrictions, which by itself would moderate inflation, but it also severely disrupted supply. Global supply
Table 2: The Macroeconomic Impact of the American Rescue Plan








$\begin{array}{r}0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ \hline-1,043 \\ \hline-3,118 \\ \hline-4,099 \\ \hline-4,154 \\ \hline-3,609 \\ \hline-2,808\end{array}$


$\underset{\sim}{1} \underset{\sim}{\sim}$


|  |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 151.9 | 0.308 | 151.9 | 0.308 |
| 133.8 | $(18.103)$ | 133.8 | $(18.103)$ |
| 140.5 | 6.688 | 140.5 | 6.688 |
| 142.5 | 1.998 | 142.5 | 1.998 |
| 143.7 | 1.262 | 142.7 | 0.219 |
| 145.2 | 1.453 | 142.1 | $(0.622)$ |
| 146.9 | 1.695 | 142.8 | 0.714 |
| 148.6 | 1.733 | 144.5 | 1.678 |
| 150.4 | 1.757 | 146.8 | 2.302 |
| 151.7 | 1.371 | 148.9 | 2.172 |
| 152.6 | 0.842 | 150.2 | 1.231 |
| 153.2 | 0.640 | 150.8 | 0.622 |
| 153.8 | 0.607 | 151.3 | 0.526 |
| 154.3 | 0.470 | 151.8 | 0.453 |
| 154.7 | 0.383 | 152.2 | 0.413 |
| 155.1 | 0.376 | 152.6 | 0.448 |
| 155.4 | 0.326 | 153.1 | 0.441 |
| 155.6 | 0.272 | 153.5 | 0.393 |
| 155.9 | 0.229 | 153.8 | 0.339 |
| 156.0 | 0.164 | 154.0 | 0.242 |
| 156.2 | 0.115 | 154.2 | 0.161 |
| 156.3 | 0.099 | 154.3 | 0.138 |
| 156.4 | 0.102 | 154.5 | 0.143 |
| 156.5 | 0.103 | 154.6 | 0.146 | 0000 a






chains were badly scrambled, as this wave of the pandemic was especially hard on Southeast Asia, which was lightly vaccinated at the time, and where most supply chains begin.

The job market was also roiled by the Delta wave, as some 8 million people told the Bureau of Census' Pulse Survey last September that they weren't working because they were either sick, taking care of someone who was sick or fearful of getting sick. This is largely why so many open positions have gone unfilled, particularly for lower-wage jobs in industries where workers are in close contact with their patrons, such as retailing, restaurants, healthcare and education and childcare services. Wage growth has sharply accelerated, as employers struggled to keep their businesses staffed, especially for these type of jobs. The Omicron wave further complicated efforts to get workers back on the job, as in January at the peak of that wave, some 12 million people told Census they weren't working because of the virus.

Although the ARP was costly to U.S. taxpayers, without it, the ultimate cost to. them would have been equally as large. Because of the weaker economy and automatic fiscal stabilizers, tax revenues would have been lower and government outlays higher. By the end of this decade, the nation's debt burden would have been as large as it will end up being with the ARP (see Chart 14).

## Chart 14: Debt Burdens As Heavy Without ARP

U.S. public debt outstanding, \% of GDP, fiscal year


Sources: BEA, U.S. Treasury, Moody's Analytics

## Canada and Mexico

Canada's and Mexico's economies have benefited enormously from the massive fiscal support provided by the U.S. The Canadian and Mexican economies are closely linked to the U.S. economy through trade, investment and immigration flows. These links are particularly important for the North American vehicle industry, because autos dominate trade between the U.S. and the rest of the continent. Without the fiscal support provided in the U.S., nearly 6 million fewer new vehicles would have been sold in the U.S. in 2021, which, combined with an overall reduction in U.S. goods consumption, would have slammed the Canadian and Mexican economies.

Without pandemic-related fiscal support in the U.S., real GDP in 2021 would have been $8 \%$ lower in Mexico and 6\% lower in Canada (see Chart 15).

## Chart 15: Spillovers From U.S. Fiscal Policy

Real GDP, 2019Q4=100



Source: Moody's Analytics

## Advanced economies

Governments in other advanced economies have also marshaled substantial fiscal support in response to the pandemic (see Table 3). Job retention schemes have been an especially favored policy. These schemes helped cover the wages paid to workers who, instead of being laid off, were put on furlough or had their hours cut. Germany, France, Italy and Japan already had short-time work schemes but either increased eligibility or boosted the generosity of benefits, or did both. The pandemic spurred the U.K. government to stand up a new scheme, while Canadian policymakers introduced a new wage subsidy covering a fixed percentage of wages regardless of hours not worked.

These job retention schemes not only maintained incomes and supported consumer demand but also significantly limited the rise in unemployment. With the exception of Canada, jobless rates increased meaningfully less in these advanced economies than in the U.S., where expanded unemployment insurance benefits were the primary mechanism to support beleaguered workers. ${ }^{11}$

Keeping more workers on payrolls also ensured fewer difficulties getting people back to work as economies reopened, limiting disruptive labor shortages and the resulting wage and price pressures. Though inflation has increased substantially in most advanced economies, this helps explain why it has been less than in the U.S.

Advanced economies also did not hold back in buttressing household incomes via other social safety net programs. Most notably, the Japanese government issued cash payments to residents and an extra child allowance.

## Table 3: Fiscal Response to COVID-19 in Other Advanced Economies

| Euro Zone | Provisions |  | USD bil |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Germany | Supports for firms and workers (STW benefits, grands, transfers, etc.) |  | 283.5 |
|  | Supports for public agencies and services |  | 143.1 |
|  | Tax cuts and deferrals |  | 63.7 |
|  | Public investment |  | 15.9 |
|  |  | Germany total | 506.2 |
| France | Supports for firms and workers (STW benefits, grands, transfers, etc.) |  | 117.6 |
|  | Public investment |  | 87.2 |
|  | Tax cuts and deferrals |  | 30.1 |
|  |  | France total | 234.9 |
| Italy | Supports for firms and workers (STW benefits, grants, transfers, etc.) |  | 142.1 |
|  | Tax cuts and deferrals |  | 32.5 |
|  | Public investment |  | 24.6 |
|  | Supports for public agencies and services |  | 16.8 |
|  |  | Italy total | 216.0 |
| Japan | Provisions |  | USD bil |
|  | Cash payment of $¥ 100 \mathrm{~K}$ to Japanese residents and extra child allowance of $¥ 10 \mathrm{~K}$ per child |  | 138.5 |
|  | Employment adjustment subsidies |  | 97.4 |
|  | Containment measures for COVID-19 |  | 51.7 |
|  | Revitalization to cope with COVID-19 and other business supports |  | 42.3 |
|  | Support affected sectors in the form of discounts and vouchers |  | 30.5 |
|  | Supporting medical treatment providers |  | 27.6 |
|  | Measures to prevent the spread, build out medical treatment, and develop pharmaceuticals |  | 23.1 |
|  | Cash payments to SMEs and sole proprietors |  | 21.2 |
|  | Establishing rent support grant for SMEs |  | 18.7 |
|  | Additional payments to low-income single parent households |  | 1.3 |
|  | Deferred taxes and social security contributions and easing of property taxes for SMEs |  | -0.0 |
|  |  | Japan total | 452.2 |
| U.K. | Provisions |  | USD bil |
|  | Funding for National Health Service |  | 207.9 |
|  | Coronavirus Job Retention Scheme |  | 101.7 |
|  | Self-Employment Income Support Scheme |  | 37.0 |
|  | Additional transfers to devolved administrations |  | 35.2 |
|  | Direct grants to small businesses in most affected sectors |  | 25.2 |
|  | Property tax (business rate) holiday for firms in affected sectors |  | 24.2 |
|  | Expanded Universal Credit and Working Tax Credit Schemes |  | 13.4 |
|  | VAT reduced at 5\% for hospitality, accommodation, and attractions until the end of Sep 2021, at 12.5\% until Mar 2022 |  | 9.6 |
|  | Temporary cut on stamp duty land tax until June 2021 |  | 6.6 |
|  | Fuel Duty: one year freeze in 2021-22 |  | 5.6 |
|  | Rent support by increasing the Local Housing Allowance |  | 5.6 |
|  | Public sector and social housing decarbonization and Green Homes Grant |  | 5.3 |
|  | Bring forward public infrastructure spending to FY2020/21 |  | 5.3 |
|  | Boost of active labour market policies |  | 3.8 |
|  | Waiver of VAT and customs duties on critical medical imports |  | 2.9 |
|  | Support for culture, charities and sport |  | 2.9 |
|  | Funding to cover the National Minimum Wage for 25 hrs a wk for 6 mos |  | 2.7 |
|  | Alcohol Duty: one year freeze in 2021-22 |  | 2.1 |
|  | Deferral of VAT for 2020Q2 until June 21 |  | 2.0 |
|  | Eat Out to Help Out |  | 1.1 |
|  | Deferral of income tax (self-assessment) of the self-employed until the end of January 2021 |  | 0.9 |
|  | Extension the window for starting deferred payments through the VAT New Payment Scheme by up to 3 mos |  | 0.6 |
|  | Funding of 40,000 traineeships and 27,000 job coaches |  | 0.6 |
|  | Statutory Sick Pay Rebate Scheme |  | 0.5 |
|  |  | U.K. total | 502.7 |
| Canada | Provisions |  | USD bil |
|  | Canada Emergency Wage Subsidy |  | 76.9 |
|  | Canada Emergency Response Benefit |  | 64.0 |
|  | Support to Health System |  | 46.5 |
|  | Canada Recovery Benefits |  | 17.7 |
|  | Canada Emergency Business Account |  | 11.2 |
|  | Enhancements to Employment Insurance |  | 7.9 |
|  | Enhanced GST Credit |  | 4.3 |
|  | Canada Emergency Rent Subsidy and Lockdown Support |  | 3.4 |
|  | Other Measures to Support Vulnerable Canadians (Transfers) |  | 2.9 |
|  | Other Direct Support Measures |  | 2.8 |
|  | Canada Emergency Student Benefit |  | 2.3 |
|  | Wage Top-Up for Essential Workers |  | 2.3 |
|  | Income Tax, Sales Tax, and Customs Duty Payment Deferrals |  | 2.3 |
|  | Other Support for Businesses (Direct Govt Outlays) |  | 2.0 |
|  | Other Support for Businesses (Transfers) |  | 2.0 |
|  | 10\% Temporary Wage Subsidy |  | 1.9 |
|  | One-Time Payment for Seniors Eligible for OAS and GIS |  | 1.9 |
|  | Canada Emergency Commercial Rent Assistance for Small Business |  | 1.6 |
|  | Enhanced Canada Child Benefit |  | 1.5 |
|  | Regional Relief and Recovery Fund |  | 1.1 |
|  | Air Sector |  | 1.0 |
|  | Other Measures to Support Vulnerable Canadians (Direct Govt Outlays) |  | 0.8 |
|  | Support for Persons with Disabilities |  | 0.7 |
|  | Supporting Community Service Organizations |  | 0.6 |
|  | Support for Innovative Businesses |  | 0.5 |
|  | Support for Workers in the Live Events and Arts Sectors |  | 0.2 |
|  |  | Canada total | 260.4 |

Some advanced economies were somewhat hampered by budget constraints in providing support. Italy, for example, had less fiscal space for direct spending and therefore relied more heavily on loan guarantees. The EU was able to work around budgetary constraints through joint stimulus measures that were funded by mutualized debt obligations. Our analysis does not include the impact of Europe's Recovery and Resilience Facility, but these plans supported market confidence, which in turn kept interest rates low and allowed countries to spend more than would have otherwise been the case.

Advanced economies also benefited from fiscal support in other countries. In Europe, these spillover effects were most evident in Germany, where the country's fiscal measures were not much greater, as a share of GDP, than those in France and Italy. German exports, particularly of vehicles, have been significantly buoyed by global demand that would have been substantially diminished without the fiscal help provided around the world (see Chart 16).

## Chart 16: German Exports Are Crushed

Real German exports, $2015 €$ bil, SAAR


Sources: Destatis, Moody's Analytics

The fiscal support has also helped Japan avoid a much more serious bout of deflation. Like the U.S. dollar, the Japanese yen is a safe-haven currency that generally appreciates when global investors are nervous. In the counterfactual scenario without government support, investors are substantially more skittish and thus flock to the yen, pushing up its value by over $10 \%$ on a trade-weighted basis. This puts severe downward pressure on Japanese prices (see Chart 17).

## Emerging markets

Emerging markets have been hit hard by successive waves of the virus, and a world without fiscal stimulus would have been far less kind. Although the three largest emerging economies-China, India and Brazil-traced different paths with respect to the magnitude and composition of fiscal support, the consequences of not providing fiscal support are similarly clear: weaker economic recoveries, higher unemployment, and diminished long-run growth (see Table 4).

## Chart 17: Deflation for Longer in Japan

## Japanese consumer price index, \% change yr ago



Sources: Japan Statistics Bureau, Moody's Analytics

Table 4: Fiscal Response to COVID-19 in Emerging Markets

| China | Provisions |  | USD bil |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Support for employment, incomes, reductions in taxes and fees for small businesses |  | 299.7 |
|  | Infrastructure spending |  | 239.7 |
|  | Exemptions from social insurance payments, reduction or exemption of value-added tax |  | 74.9 |
|  | Waiving of toll roads, reduction in commerical electricity tariffs |  | 50.5 |
|  |  | China total | 664.8 |
| India | Provisions |  | USD bil |
|  | Food aid and cooking gas |  | 30.8 |
|  | Fertilizer subsidy |  | 10.8 |
|  | Financial assistance for construction workers |  | 4.3 |
|  | Cash transfers to female heads of household |  | 4.1 |
|  | Increase in cash transfers for rural households |  | 3.7 |
|  | Infrastructure investment |  | 3.4 |
|  | Additional spending on public health |  | 3.1 |
|  | Travel and consumption vouchers |  | 2.6 |
|  | Subsidies for construction industry |  | 2.4 |
|  | Advance payments to farmers |  | 2.4 |
|  | Job support for rural economy |  | 1.4 |
|  | Supplemental health insurance for hospital workers exposed to COVID-19 |  | 1.3 |
|  | Cash transfers to senior citizens |  | 0.4 |
|  | Payroll support program |  | 0.3 |
|  | Research and development funding for vaccine |  | 0.1 |
|  |  | India total | 71.0 |
| Brazil | Provisions |  | USD bil |
|  | Emergency family income |  | 67.1 |
|  | Aid for state and local governments |  | 14.8 |
|  | Additional spending on public health |  | 13.0 |
|  | Payroll support program |  | 9.1 |
|  | Vaccine procurement |  | 4.6 |
|  | Credits for machinery and equipment |  | 0.9 |
|  | Aid to tourism industry |  | 0.7 |
|  | Aid to energy sector |  | 0.2 |
|  | Expansion of Bolsa Familia |  | 0.1 |
|  |  | Brazil total | 110.4 |

[^4]For China, the severe hit to global trade in the counterfactual scenario precipitates a double-dip recession, with the economy contracting again in the first half of 2021. The subsequent economic recovery is also materially slower. Global trade is a critical driver of China's recovery, and with less trade, the Chinese economy would have stumbled well into 2021.

Though Chinese officials spent less on direct fiscal support than they did during the global financial crisis, the timing and composition of spending were critical. Most of the support was delivered in the third quarter of 2020, when the recovery in global trade was nascent. While a large share of spending went toward infrastructure, almost half of the support was directed toward relief for consumers and businesses in a departure from China's traditional infrastructure-heavy playbook. Without this boost, the economic recovery would have been cut short.

As in the rest of Latin America, the pandemic ripped through Brazil. But Brazil spent more on direct fiscal support to its economy than almost any other emerging economy. Without this support, public health and economic outcomes would have been substantially worse. The Brazilian economy would have fallen back into recession in the first half of 2021 and would not have recouped its pre-pandemic peak until the second half of 2024.

India's economy benefits the least from fiscal support, since overall government spending was limited. Even with the extension of cash transfer programs during the Delta wave of the pandemic, which hit India especially hard, cumulative spending in the past two years was just over $2 \%$ of GDP. Global fiscal support also played a role in India's recovery, though to a lesser extent than in China and Brazil. This is because India's economy is less reliant on trade overall and global fiscal policy was more effective at reviving trade in goods than in services, for which India has a comparative advantage.

## Conclusion

The massive global fiscal policy response to the pandemic deserves significant credit for limiting the severity and length of the recession that occurred when the pandemic struck, and for the subsequently strong global economic recovery (see Table 5).

There has been criticism of global policymakers for going overboard on the fiscal support, with critics pointing to recent concerns over high inflation and bigger government deficits and debt loads. But as we show, even without the fiscal support, inflation would still be a worry. Not because inflation would have been too high, but too low-as it had been since the financial crisis. Many global central banks would have nervously watched as their economies flirted with or suffered outright deflation in 2020. Though global inflation would have picked up in 2021 because of base effects of prices being depressed a year earlier, its rebound would have been slower.

Further, the fiscal situation of most countries already would have been even worse if they had not provided the fiscal support, as their much-weakened economies would have caused tax revenues to plummet and government expenditures to automatically increase (see Chart 18). The case is the same for the U.S., although it will take a bit longer for this to become clear.

## Chart 18: More Debt Was Unavoidable

Debt-to-GDP ratio, ppt increase from 2019Q4 to 2021Q4


Thus, second-guessing the aggressive fiscal policy response of governments to the pandemic is misplaced. Governments had no choice but to act quickly and massively. Perhaps some of the specific policy steps taken during the crisis could have been better designed, at least in hindsight. However, policymakers' decisiveness in pushing forward with substantial government support has been an economic game changer.
Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies


| 2,201 | (10.1) | 2,196 | $(10.9)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

 | 0 |
| :--- |
|  |
|  |
| $\vdots$ | $\stackrel{n}{n}$ $\stackrel{\infty}{\infty}$



 $1.5-2,350-1.8$

|  | India |  |  |  | France |  |  |  | Italy |  |  |  | Brazil |  |  |  | Canada |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Baseline } \\ \text { 2011- } \\ \text { 2012INR bil } \end{array}$ | Ann. growth | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Counterfact } \\ \text { 2011- } \\ \text { 2012INR bil } \end{array}$ | tual <br> Ann. growth | $\begin{gathered} \text { Baseline } \\ \text { 2015EUR } \\ \text { bil g } \end{gathered}$ |  | Counterfact 2015EUR bil | tual <br> Ann. growth | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Baseline } \\ \text { 2015EUR } \\ \text { bil } \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Counterfact 2015EUR bil | tual <br> Ann. growth | Baseline 1995BRL <br> bil g | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Counterfact 1995BRL bil | tual <br> Ann. growth |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Counterfact 2012CAD bil | $\begin{aligned} & \text { tual } \\ & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ |
| 2020Q1 | 148,162 | 10.1 | 147,222 | 7.4 | 2,198 | (20.9) | 2,192 | (21.8) | 1,622 | (21.4) | 1,616 | (22.5) | 1,203 | (8.8) | 1,180 | (15.3) | 2,077 | (8.4) | 2,077 | (8.4) |
| 2020Q2 | 110,208 | (69.4) | 108,147 | (70.9) | 1,902 | (44.0) | 1,867 | (47.3) | 1,415 | (42.0) | 1,345 | (52.0) | 1,096 | (31.0) | 991 | (50.3) | 1,848 | (37.4) | 1,806 | (42.9) |
| 2020Q3 | 133,337 | 114.3 | 129,884 | 108.0 | 2,256 | 98.0 | 2,167 | 81.4 | 1,639 | 79.8 | 1,543 | 73.2 | 1,181 | 34.9 | 1,044 | 23.2 | 2,014 | 41.1 | 1,905 | 23.9 |
| 2020 Q 4 | 145,259 | 40.9 | 141,288 | 40.0 | 2,231 | (4.3) | 2,138 | (5.1) | 1,611 | (6.6) | 1,556 | 3.2 | 1,218 | 13.0 | 1,146 | 45.1 | 2,058 | 9.1 | 1,906 | 0.2 |
| 2021Q1 | 150,601 | 15.5 | 146,309 | 15.0 | 2,234 | 0.6 | 2,159 | 3.9 | 1,616 | 1.3 | 1,544 | (2.9) | 1,234 | 5.5 | 1,157 | 3.7 | 2,083 | 4.9 | 1,907 | 0.2 |
| 2021 Q 2 | 132,428 | (40.2) | 127,857 | (41.7) | 2,264 | 5.4 | 2,186 | 5.1 | 1,661 | 11.4 | 1,575 | 8.1 | 1,230 | (1.4) | 1,148 | (3.0) | 2,066 | (3.2) | 1,857 | (10.1) |
| 2021 Q 3 | 144,512 | 41.8 | 139,624 | 42.2 | 2,335 | 13.2 | 2,258 | 14.0 | 1,704 | 10.9 | 1,612 | 9.7 | 1,229 | (0.4) | 1,142 | (2.0) | 2,094 | 5.4 | 1,891 | 7.5 |
| 2021 Q 4 | 155,206 | 33.1 | 151,006 | 36.8 | 2,352 | 2.9 | 2,277 | 3.3 | 1,714 | 2.5 | 1,619 | 1.9 | 1,227 | (0.5) | 1,141 | (0.3) | 2,118 | 4.6 | 1,941 | 11.0 |
| 2022 Q 1 | 156,262 | 2.7 | 152,782 | 4.8 | 2,361 | 1.5 | 2,288 | 1.9 | 1,725 | 2.5 | 1,633 | 3.4 | 1,229 | 0.5 | 1,149 | 2.6 | 2,125 | 1.3 | 1,971 | 6.4 |
| 2022 Q 2 | 157,824 | 4.1 | 154,968 | 5.8 | 2,378 | 3.0 | 2,310 | 4.0 | 1,742 | 4.0 | 1,654 | 5.2 | 1,239 | 3.2 | 1,159 | 3.5 | 2,157 | 6.2 | 2,021 | 10.5 |
| 2022Q3 | 158,929 | 2.8 | 156,621 | 4.3 | 2,399 | 3.5 | 2,334 | 4.2 | 1,754 | 2.8 | 1,668 | 3.4 | 1,248 | 3.0 | 1,168 | 3.2 | 2,188 | 5.9 | 2,064 | 8.8 |
| 2022 Q 4 | 160,677 | 4.5 | 158,788 | 5.6 | 2,414 | 2.6 | 2,353 | 3.2 | 1,765 | 2.5 | 1,679 | 2.7 | 1,256 | 2.6 | 1,177 | 3.2 | 2,209 | 4.0 | 2,091 | 5.3 |
| 2023 Q 1 | 163,023 | 6.0 | 161,337 | 6.6 | 2,427 | 2.2 | 2,367 | 2.5 | 1,774 | 2.2 | 1,688 | 2.3 | 1,263 | 2.4 | 1,186 | 3.0 | 2,226 | 3.1 | 2,109 | 3.4 |
| $2023 \mathrm{Q}^{2}$ | 166,121 | 7.8 | 164,478 | 8.0 | 2,439 | 2.0 | 2,380 | 2.2 | 1,784 | 2.1 | 1,698 | 2.3 | 1,270 | 2.4 | 1,193 | 2.6 | 2,240 | 2.4 | 2,121 | 2.3 |
| 2023 Q 3 | 169,177 | 7.6 | 167,455 | 7.4 | 2,450 | 1.8 | 2,392 | 2.0 | 1,793 | 2.2 | 1,708 | 2.5 | 1,278 | 2.3 | 1,200 | 2.3 | 2,252 | 2.2 | 2,133 | 2.2 |
| 2023 Q 4 | 172,798 | 8.8 | 170,931 | 8.6 | 2,461 | 1.8 | 2,403 | 1.9 | 1,803 | 2.2 | 1,719 | 2.6 | 1,285 | 2.3 | 1,208 | 2.5 | 2,263 | 2.1 | 2,144 | 2.1 |
| 2024 Q 1 | 175,482 | 6.4 | 173,483 | 6.1 | 2,473 | 1.9 | 2,415 | 2.0 | 1,811 | 1.8 | 1,728 | 2.2 | 1,294 | 2.8 | 1,217 | 3.1 | 2,274 | 1.9 | 2,154 | 1.9 |
| $2024 \mathrm{Q}^{2}$ | 178,332 | 6.7 | 176,186 | 6.4 | 2,485 | 2.0 | 2,428 | 2.1 | 1,818 | 1.6 | 1,737 | 2.0 | 1,303 | 2.9 | 1,226 | 3.2 | 2,284 | 1.8 | 2,164 | 1.8 |
| 2024 Q 3 | 181,154 | 6.5 | 178,871 | 6.2 | 2,497 | 1.9 | 2,440 | 2.1 | 1,825 | 1.6 | 1,746 | 2.1 | 1,313 | 2.9 | 1,235 | 2.9 | 2,294 | 1.7 | 2,173 | 1.8 |
| 2024 Q 4 | 183,989 | 6.4 | 181,571 | 6.2 | 2,508 | 1.8 | 2,452 | 2.0 | 1,833 | 1.7 | 1,756 | 2.3 | 1,322 | 2.9 | 1,245 | 3.0 | 2,304 | 1.7 | 2,183 | 1.8 |
| 2025Q1 | 186,752 | 6.1 | 184,206 | 5.9 | 2,519 | 1.8 | 2,465 | 2.0 | 1,841 | 1.8 | 1,766 | 2.4 | 1,331 | 2.8 | 1,254 | 3.1 | 2,313 | 1.7 | 2,194 | 1.9 |
| 2025Q2 | 189,428 | 5.9 | 186,751 | 5.6 | 2,528 | 1.4 | 2,475 | 1.7 | 1,850 | 1.8 | 1,777 | 2.4 | 1,341 | 2.8 | 1,264 | 3.2 | 2,323 | 1.7 | 2,204 | 2.0 |
| 2025Q3 | 192,009 | 5.6 | 189,203 | 5.4 | 2,537 | 1.4 | 2,485 | 1.7 | 1,857 | 1.7 | 1,787 | 2.3 | 1,350 | 2.9 | 1,274 | 3.3 | 2,333 | 1.7 | 2,215 | 1.9 |
| 2025Q4 | 194,603 | 5.5 | 191,667 | 5.3 | 2,546 | 1.4 | 2,496 | 1.7 | 1,865 | 1.5 | 1,797 | 2.2 | 1,360 | 2.9 | 1,285 | 3.4 | 2,343 | 1.7 | 2,225 | 1.9 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2020 | 134,242 | (7.1) | 131,636 | (8.9) | 2,147 | (8.0) | 2,091 | (10.4) | 1,572 | (9.0) | 1,515 | (12.3) | 1,174 | (4.2) | 1,090 | (11.0) | 1,999 | (5.2) | 1,923 | (8.8) |
| 2021 | 145,687 | 8.5 | 141,199 | 7.3 | 2,297 | 7.0 | 2,220 | 6.2 | 1,674 | 6.5 | 1,587 | 4.8 | 1,230 | 4.7 | 1,147 | 5.2 | 2,090 | 4.5 | 1,899 | (1.3) |
| 2022 | 158,423 | 8.7 | 155,790 | 10.3 | 2,388 | 4.0 | 2,321 | 4.6 | 1,746 | 4.3 | 1,658 | 4.5 | 1,243 | 1.0 | 1,163 | 1.4 | 2,170 | 3.8 | 2,037 | 7.3 |
| 2023 | 167,780 | 5.9 | 166,050 | 6.6 | 2,445 | 2.4 | 2,386 | 2.8 | 1,789 | 2.4 | 1,703 | 2.7 | 1,274 | 2.5 | 1,197 | 2.9 | 2,245 | 3.5 | 2,127 | 4.4 |
| 2024 | 179,739 | 7.1 | 177,528 | 6.9 | 2,491 | 1.9 | 2,434 | 2.0 | 1,822 | 1.9 | 1,742 | 2.3 | 1,308 | 2.7 | 1,231 | 2.8 | 2,289 | 1.9 | 2,168 | 2.0 |
| 2025 | 190,698 | 6.1 | 187,957 | 5.9 | 2,533 | 1.7 | 2,480 | 1.9 | 1,853 | 1.7 | 1,782 | 2.3 | 1,345 | 2.9 | 1,269 | 3.1 | 2,328 | 1.7 | 2,209 | 1.9 |

Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics
Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies (Cont.)

|  | World |  |  |  | U.S. |  |  |  | China |  |  |  | Japan |  |  |  | Germany |  |  |  | U.K. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Basel Mil | ine <br> Change, mil | Counter | factual <br> Change, mil | Baselin | Change, mil | Counterfa <br> Mil | Change, mil | Baselin | Change, mil | Counterf <br> Mil | ctual <br> Change, mil | Baselin <br> Mil | Change, mil | Counterfa <br> Mil | actual <br> Change, mil | Baselin <br> Mil | Change, mil | Counterfa <br> Mil | actual <br> Change, mil | Baselin <br> Mil | Change, mil | Counterfa <br> Mil | Change, mil |
| 2020Q1 | 2,565.5 | (9.104) | 2,563.8 | (10.807) | 157.7 | (0.838) | 156.9 | (1.666) | 774.3 | (0.307) | 774.3 | (0.316) | 67.4 | (0.110) | 67.4 | (0.123) | 43.3 | (0.051) | 43.3 | (0.075) | 33.0 | 0.078 | 32.9 | (0.038) |
| 2020Q2 | 2,406.2 | (159.277) | 2,395.7 | (168.045) | 137.6 |  | 131.4 | (25.460) | 774.3 | 0.043 | 774.3 | 0.013 | 66.3 | (1.057) | 66.3 | (1.103) | 42.9 | (0.372) | 42.8 | (0.483) | 32.6 | (0.407) | 32.4 | (0.521) |
| 2020Q3 | 2,486.6 | 80.363 | 2,464.8 | 69.082 | 146.2 | 8.584 | 134.6 | 3.197 | 772.3 | (2.077) | 771.6 | (2.657) | 66.6 | 0.203 | 66.4 | 0.102 | 42.9 | 0.002 | 42.5 | (0.333) | 32.4 | (0.255) | 32.0 | (0.384) |
| 2020Q4 | 2,511.7 | 25.171 | 2,483.4 | 18.556 | 149.8 | 3.630 | 136.0 | 1.424 | 770.0 | (2.252) | 767.3 | (4.313) | 66.8 | 0.203 | 66.5 | 0.081 | 42.9 | (0.037) | 42.0 | (0.500) | 32.1 | (0.201) | 31.7 | (0.316) |
| 2021Q1 | 2,526.3 | 14.622 | 2,490.6 | 7.269 | 150.4 | 0.649 | 133.6 | (2.402) | 770.9 | 0.892 | 765.9 | (1.463) | 66.9 | 0.163 | 66.5 | 0.044 | 43.2 | 0.268 | 42.0 | 0.015 | 32.2 | 0.032 | 31.6 | (0.074) |
| 2021Q2 | 2,531.8 | 5.474 | 2,489.6 | (0.995) | 151.5 | 1.037 | 134.0 | 0.393 | 770.3 | (0.578) | 762.7 | (3.121) | 66.6 | (0.353) | 66.1 | (0.453) | 43.4 | 0.212 | 42.2 | 0.240 | 32.3 | 0.095 | 31.6 | (0.020) |
| 2021Q3 | 2,536.0 | 4.173 | 2,491.7 | 2.117 | 153.2 | 1.752 | 138.1 | 4.100 | 769.9 | (0.430) | 759.5 | (3.266) | 66.8 | 0.210 | 66.2 | 0.161 | 43.4 | 0.011 | 42.3 | 0.113 | 32.5 | 0.247 | 31.8 | 0.201 |
| 2021Q4 | 2,546.2 | 10.165 | 2,502.5 | 10.792 | 155.2 | 1.952 | 142.4 | 4.299 | 770.0 | 0.082 | 758.3 | (1.177) | 66.4 | (0.370) | 65.9 | (0.362) | 43.3 | (0.058) | 42.3 | (0.010) | 32.5 | (0.055) | 31.8 | (0.030) |
| 2022Q1 | 2,560.3 | 14.134 | 2,518.8 | 16.306 | 157.0 | 1.827 | 146.2 | 3.736 | 770.2 | 0.207 | 757.9 | (0.436) | 66.9 | 0.537 | 66.4 | 0.578 | 43.5 | 0.170 | 42.5 | 0.191 | 32.5 | 0.027 | 31.8 | 0.080 |
| 2022Q2 | 2,572.2 | 11.865 | 2,533.4 | 14.533 | 157.5 | 0.530 | 148.0 | 1.882 | 770.0 | (0.160) | 757.3 | (0.584) | 67.2 | 0.271 | 66.8 | 0.328 | 43.5 | 0.037 | 42.6 | 0.058 | 32.5 | 0.006 | 31.9 | 0.057 |
| 2022Q3 | 2,581.5 | 9.299 | 2,545.1 | 11.708 | 158.1 | 0.537 | 149.3 | 1.204 | 769.7 | (0.319) | 756.7 | (0.571) | 67.4 | 0.140 | 67.0 | 0.190 | 43.6 | 0.040 | 42.6 | 0.080 | 32.5 | 0.042 | 32.0 | 0.091 |
| 2022Q4 | 2,588.3 | 6.815 | 2,554.1 | 8.983 | 158.6 | 0.498 | 149.9 | 0.621 | 769.0 | (0.660) | 756.1 | (0.642) | 67.4 | 0.098 | 67.1 | 0.132 | 43.6 | 0.043 | 42.7 | 0.100 | 32.6 | 0.066 | 32.1 | 0.126 |
| 2023Q1 | 2,592.2 | 3.936 | 2,560.0 | 5.950 | 159.0 | 0.459 | 150.3 | 0.450 | 767.0 | (2.016) | 754.5 | (1.606) | 67.5 | 0.065 | 67.2 | 0.087 | 43.7 | 0.043 | 42.8 | 0.087 | 32.7 | 0.059 | 32.2 | 0.115 |
| 2023Q2 | 2,597.0 | 4.757 | 2,566.5 | 6.516 | 159.4 | 0.409 | 150.9 | 0.576 | 766.2 | (0.823) | 754.0 | (0.433) | 67.6 | 0.065 | 67.3 | 0.078 | 43.7 | 0.037 | 42.9 | 0.070 | 32.7 | 0.043 | 32.3 | 0.085 |
| 2023Q3 | 2,602.3 | 5.304 | 2,573.4 | 6.864 | 159.8 | 0.375 | 151.6 | 0.690 | 765.4 | (0.795) | 753.6 | (0.382) | 67.6 | 0.063 | 67.3 | 0.072 | 43.7 | 0.029 | 43.0 | 0.051 | 32.7 | 0.025 | 32.4 | 0.054 |
| 2023Q4 | 2,608.4 | 6.096 | 2,580.8 | 7.404 | 160.2 | 0.353 | 152.3 | 0.670 | 764.7 | (0.736) | 753.3 | (0.304) | 67.7 | 0.062 | 67.4 | 0.068 | 43.7 | 0.020 | 43.0 | 0.036 | 32.8 | 0.017 | 32.4 | 0.037 |
| 2024Q1 | 2,614.8 | 6.470 | 2,588.4 | 7.580 | 160.5 | 0.333 | 152.9 | 0.630 | 763.9 | (0.720) | 753.0 | (0.293) | 67.8 | 0.056 | 67.5 | 0.060 | 43.8 | 0.012 | 43.0 | 0.024 | 32.8 | 0.018 | 32.4 | 0.033 |
| 2024Q2 | 2,621.0 | 6.143 | 2,595.5 | 7.094 | 160.8 | 0.268 | 153.5 | 0.581 | 763.2 | (0.793) | 752.6 | (0.418) | 67.8 | 0.052 | 67.5 | 0.053 | 43.8 | 0.007 | 43.0 | 0.016 | 32.8 | 0.020 | 32.5 | 0.030 |
| 2024Q3 | 2,626.7 | 5.730 | 2,602.0 | 6.501 | 161.0 | 0.234 | 154.0 | 0.493 | 762.3 | (0.829) | 752.1 | (0.490) | 67.9 | 0.048 | 67.6 | 0.046 | 43.8 | 0.003 | 43.0 | 0.010 | 32.8 | 0.021 | 32.5 | 0.029 |
| 2024Q4 | 2,632.1 | 5.355 | 2,608.1 | 6.088 | 161.2 | 0.155 | 154.4 | 0.444 | 761.5 | (0.848) | 751.6 | (0.532) | 67.9 | 0.046 | 67.6 | 0.041 | 43.8 | 0.001 | 43.0 | 0.009 | 32.8 | 0.022 | 32.5 | 0.027 |
| 2025Q1 | 2,637.1 | 5.077 | 2,613.9 | 5.832 | 161.3 | 0.121 | 154.9 | 0.450 | 760.6 | (0.860) | 751.0 | (0.561) | 68.0 | 0.045 | 67.6 | 0.039 | 43.8 | 0.002 | 43.1 | 0.010 | 32.9 | 0.020 | 32.5 | 0.025 |
| 2025Q2 | 2,641.9 | 4.755 | 2,619.4 | 5.517 | 161.4 | 0.093 | 155.3 | 0.424 | 759.8 | (0.860) | 750.5 | (0.573) | 68.0 | 0.045 | 67.7 | 0.041 | 43.8 | 0.001 | 43.1 | 0.011 | 32.9 | 0.019 | 32.6 | 0.025 |
| 2025Q3 | 2,646.6 | 4.708 | 2,624.9 | 5.456 | 161.5 | 0.097 | 155.7 | 0.409 | 758.9 | (0.842) | 749.9 | (0.571) | 68.0 | 0.044 | 67.7 | 0.043 | 43.8 | (0.001) | 43.1 | 0.010 | 32.9 | 0.018 | 32.6 | 0.024 |
| 2025Q4 | 2,651.2 | 4.565 | 2,630.2 | 5.313 | 161.6 | 0.089 | 156.1 | 0.393 | 758.1 | (0.823) | 749.3 | (0.566) | 68.1 | 0.043 | 67.8 | 0.044 | 43.8 | (0.004) | 43.1 | 0.008 | 32.9 | 0.019 | 32.6 | 0.025 |


| 2020 | 2,492.5 | (65.820) | 2,476.9 | (81.393) | 147.8 | (9.724) | 139.7 | (17.792) | 772.7 | (1.993) | 771.9 | (2.830) | 66.8 | (0.477) | 66.6 | (0.605) | 43.0 | (0.201) | 42.6 | (0.592) | 32.5 | (0.270) | 32.2 | (0.564) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2021 | 2,535.1 | 42.596 | 2,493.6 | 16.726 | 152.6 | 4.772 | 137.1 | (2.681) | 770.3 | (2.452) | 761.6 | (10.291) | 66.7 | (0.099) | 66.2 | (0.470) | 43.3 | 0.298 | 42.2 | (0.413) | 32.4 | (0.167) | 31.7 | (0.556) |
| 2022 | 2,575.5 | 40.466 | 2,537.8 | 44.209 | 157.8 | 5.217 | 148.3 | 11.278 | 769.7 | (0.536) | 757.0 | (4.616) | 67.2 | 0.574 | 66.8 | 0.647 | 43.6 | 0.244 | 42.6 | 0.408 | 32.5 | 0.175 | 32.0 | 0.273 |
| 2023 | 2,600.0 | 24.407 | 2,570.2 | 32.345 | 159.6 | 1.816 | 151.3 | 2.932 | 765.8 | (3.909) | 753.9 | (3.110) | 67.6 | 0.372 | 67.3 | 0.475 | 43.7 | 0.152 | 42.9 | 0.303 | 32.7 | 0.180 | 32.3 | 0.369 |
| 2024 | 2,623.6 | 23.694 | 2,598.5 | 28.287 | 160.9 | 1.245 | 153.7 | 2.415 | 762.7 | (3.097) | 752.4 | (1.512) | 67.8 | 0.225 | 67.5 | 0.240 | 43.8 | 0.057 | 43.0 | 0.113 | 32.8 | 0.085 | 32.5 | 0.153 |
| 2025 | 2,644.2 | 20.556 | 2,622.1 | 23.615 | 161.4 | 0.563 | 155.5 | 1.796 | 759.3 | (3.380) | 750.2 | (2.167) | 68.0 | 0.183 | 67.7 | 0.168 | 43.8 | 0.005 | 43.1 | 0.041 | 32.9 | 0.080 | 32.6 | 0.10 |

Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies (Cont.)

Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics

|  | World |  |  |  | China |  | Japan |  | Germany |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual |
| 2020Q1 | 6.2 | 6.3 | 3.8 | 4.3 | 3.6 | 3.6 | 2.4 | 2.5 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 4.0 | 4.3 |
| 2020Q2 | 9.3 | 9.7 | 13.0 | 16.8 | 3.7 | 3.7 | 2.7 | 2.8 | 6.1 | 6.4 | 4.1 | 4.8 |
| 2020Q3 | 8.0 | 8.8 | 8.8 | 15.9 | 4.0 | 4.2 | 3.0 | 3.2 | 6.3 | 7.2 | 4.8 | 5.8 |
| 2020Q4 | 7.5 | 8.5 | 6.8 | 15.0 | 4.3 | 4.7 | 3.0 | 3.4 | 6.2 | 8.0 | 5.2 | 6.6 |
| 2021Q1 | 7.1 | 8.4 | 6.2 | 16.1 | 4.1 | 4.9 | 2.8 | 3.4 | 6.0 | 8.4 | 4.9 | 6.6 |
| 2021Q2 | 7.3 | 8.8 | 5.9 | 15.9 | 4.0 | 5.2 | 2.9 | 3.6 | 5.9 | 8.3 | 4.7 | 6.7 |
| 2021Q3 | 7.3 | 8.8 | 5.1 | 13.3 | 4.0 | 5.5 | 2.8 | 3.6 | 5.5 | 7.8 | 4.3 | 6.4 |
| 2021Q4 | 7.1 | 8.6 | 4.2 | 10.7 | 4.0 | 5.6 | 2.7 | 3.5 | 5.3 | 7.5 | 4.2 | 6.3 |
| 2022Q1 | 6.9 | 8.2 | 3.9 | 9.0 | 3.9 | 5.6 | 2.8 | 3.5 | 5.1 | 7.2 | 4.5 | 6.4 |
| 2022Q2 | 6.7 | 7.9 | 3.7 | 7.7 | 3.9 | 5.6 | 2.7 | 3.3 | 5.1 | 7.2 | 4.6 | 6.4 |
| 2022Q3 | 6.5 | 7.7 | 3.5 | 7.0 | 3.9 | 5.6 | 2.7 | 3.2 | 5.0 | 7.1 | 4.6 | 6.2 |
| 2022Q4 | 6.5 | 7.6 | 3.4 | 6.7 | 4.0 | 5.6 | 2.6 | 3.1 | 5.0 | 6.9 | 4.5 | 6.0 |
| 2023Q1 | 6.5 | 7.5 | 3.4 | 6.5 | 4.0 | 5.6 | 2.6 | 3.1 | 5.0 | 6.8 | 4.4 | 5.8 |
| 2023Q2 | 6.5 | 7.4 | 3.4 | 6.3 | 4.0 | 5.5 | 2.5 | 3.0 | 5.0 | 6.7 | 4.4 | 5.6 |
| 2023Q3 | 6.5 | 7.4 | 3.4 | 6.1 | 4.0 | 5.5 | 2.5 | 3.0 | 5.0 | 6.7 | 4.4 | 5.5 |
| 2023Q4 | 6.5 | 7.3 | 3.4 | 5.9 | 4.0 | 5.4 | 2.5 | 2.9 | 4.9 | 6.6 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2024Q1 | 6.4 | 7.2 | 3.4 | 5.8 | 4.0 | 5.4 | 2.4 | 2.9 | 4.9 | 6.6 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2024Q2 | 6.4 | 7.2 | 3.5 | 5.6 | 4.0 | 5.3 | 2.4 | 2.9 | 4.9 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2024Q3 | 6.4 | 7.1 | 3.5 | 5.6 | 4.0 | 5.3 | 2.4 | 2.8 | 4.9 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2024Q4 | 6.4 | 7.1 | 3.6 | 5.5 | 4.0 | 5.2 | 2.4 | 2.8 | 4.9 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2025Q1 | 6.4 | 7.0 | 3.7 | 5.4 | 4.0 | 5.2 | 2.3 | 2.8 | 4.9 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| 2025Q2 | 6.3 | 7.0 | 3.8 | 5.3 | 4.0 | 5.2 | 2.3 | 2.8 | 5.0 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.4 |
| 2025Q3 | 6.3 | 7.0 | 3.8 | 5.2 | 4.0 | 5.1 | 2.3 | 2.7 | 5.0 | 6.5 | 4.6 | 5.4 |
| 2025Q4 | 6.3 | 6.9 | 3.9 | 5.1 | 4.0 | 5.1 | 2.2 | 2.7 | 5.0 | 6.4 | 4.6 | 5.4 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2020 | 7.8 | 8.3 | 8.1 | 13.0 | 3.9 | 4.1 | 2.8 | 3.0 | 5.9 | 6.7 | 4.5 | 5.4 |
| 2021 | 7.2 | 8.6 | 5.4 | 14.0 | 4.0 | 5.3 | 2.8 | 3.5 | 5.7 | 8.0 | 4.5 | 6.5 |
| 2022 | 6.6 | 7.9 | 3.6 | 7.6 | 3.9 | 5.6 | 2.7 | 3.3 | 5.0 | 7.1 | 4.5 | 6.2 |
| 2023 | 6.5 | 7.4 | 3.4 | 6.2 | 4.0 | 5.5 | 2.5 | 3.0 | 5.0 | 6.7 | 4.4 | 5.6 |
| 2024 | 6.4 | 7.1 | 3.5 | 5.6 | 4.0 | 5.3 | 2.4 | 2.8 | 4.9 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.5 |
| $\underline{2025}$ | 6.3 | 7.0 | 3.8 | 5.2 | 4.0 | 5.1 | 2.3 | 2.7 | 5.0 | 6.5 | 4.5 | 5.4 |

Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics
Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies (Cont.)

|  | India |  | France |  | Italy |  | Brazil |  | Canada |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual | Baseline | Counterfactual |
| 2020Q1 | 9.1 | 9.1 | 7.8 | 7.8 | 9.0 | 9.3 | 11.6 | 12.0 | 6.4 | 6.7 |
| 2020Q2 | 20.8 | 20.8 | 7.2 | 7.4 | 8.6 | 9.2 | 13.2 | 15.7 | 12.9 | 13.8 |
| 2020Q3 | 13.2 | 13.2 | 9.1 | 9.8 | 10.0 | 11.2 | 14.9 | 20.1 | 10.1 | 12.0 |
| 2020Q4 | 10.3 | 10.4 | 8.0 | 9.1 | 9.8 | 11.5 | 14.9 | 19.5 | 8.9 | 11.8 |
| 2021Q1 | 9.3 | 9.5 | 8.1 | 9.3 | 10.1 | 12.2 | 14.3 | 18.4 | 8.4 | 12.0 |
| 2021Q2 | 11.1 | 11.4 | 8.0 | 9.5 | 9.8 | 12.4 | 14.1 | 18.4 | 7.9 | 12.1 |
| 2021Q3 | 12.2 | 12.6 | 8.1 | 9.8 | 9.1 | 12.0 | 12.7 | 16.7 | 7.2 | 11.5 |
| 2021Q4 | 12.1 | 12.7 | 8.0 | 9.8 | 9.1 | 12.2 | 12.7 | 16.7 | 6.3 | 10.2 |
| 2022Q1 | 11.3 | 11.9 | 8.0 | 9.8 | 9.3 | 12.5 | 12.9 | 16.4 | 6.3 | 9.7 |
| 2022Q2 | 10.5 | 11.0 | 8.0 | 9.8 | 9.3 | 12.8 | 12.7 | 16.0 | 5.9 | 8.9 |
| 2022Q3 | 10.0 | 10.5 | 8.0 | 9.6 | 9.3 | 13.0 | 12.6 | 15.6 | 5.8 | 8.4 |
| 2022Q4 | 9.9 | 10.3 | 8.0 | 9.5 | 9.3 | 13.1 | 12.4 | 15.2 | 5.8 | 8.2 |
| 2023Q1 | 10.0 | 10.4 | 8.0 | 9.3 | 9.2 | 13.2 | 12.2 | 14.8 | 5.9 | 8.0 |
| 2023Q2 | 10.2 | 10.5 | 7.9 | 9.2 | 9.1 | 13.3 | 12.0 | 14.4 | 5.9 | 8.0 |
| 2023Q3 | 10.2 | 10.5 | 7.9 | 9.1 | 9.1 | 13.4 | 11.8 | 14.0 | 6.0 | 8.0 |
| 2023Q4 | 10.1 | 10.4 | 7.9 | 9.0 | 9.0 | 13.5 | 11.5 | 13.6 | 6.1 | 8.0 |
| 2024Q1 | 10.0 | 10.3 | 7.9 | 9.0 | 9.0 | 13.6 | 11.2 | 13.1 | 6.1 | 7.9 |
| 2024Q2 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.9 | 8.9 | 9.0 | 13.7 | 10.8 | 12.6 | 6.1 | 7.9 |
| 2024Q3 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.8 | 9.0 | 13.8 | 10.4 | 12.1 | 6.1 | 7.8 |
| 2024Q4 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.8 | 9.0 | 13.9 | 10.1 | 11.6 | 6.1 | 7.8 |
| 2025Q1 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.7 | 8.9 | 13.9 | 9.7 | 11.2 | 6.1 | 7.7 |
| 2025Q2 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.6 | 8.9 | 14.0 | 9.4 | 10.7 | 6.1 | 7.6 |
| 2025Q3 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.6 | 8.9 | 14.0 | 9.0 | 10.2 | 6.2 | 7.6 |
| 2025Q4 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.7 | 8.5 | 8.9 | 14.1 | 8.7 | 9.8 | 6.2 | 7.5 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2020 | 13.4 | 13.4 | 8.0 | 8.6 | 9.3 | 10.3 | 13.6 | 16.8 | 9.6 | 11.1 |
| 2021 | 11.2 | 11.5 | 8.1 | 9.6 | 9.5 | 12.2 | 13.4 | 17.6 | 7.4 | 11.5 |
| 2022 | 10.4 | 10.9 | 8.0 | 9.7 | 9.3 | 12.8 | 12.6 | 15.8 | 6.0 | 8.8 |
| 2023 | 10.1 | 10.5 | 7.9 | 9.2 | 9.1 | 13.3 | 11.9 | 14.2 | 6.0 | 8.0 |
| 2024 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.9 | 9.0 | 13.7 | 10.6 | 12.4 | 6.1 | 7.8 |
| 2025 | 9.9 | 10.2 | 7.8 | 8.6 | 8.9 | 14.0 | 9.2 | 10.5 | 6.2 | 7.6 |

Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics
Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies (Cont.)

|  | World |  |  |  | U.S. |  |  |  | China |  |  |  | Japan |  |  |  | Germany |  |  |  | U.K. |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  | Baseline |  | Counterfactual |  |
|  |  | Ann. rowth | Index | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index | Ann. rowth | Index | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index | Ann. growth | Index | Ann. growth | Index g | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index g | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ | Index g | Ann. growth | Index | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Ann. } \\ & \text { growth } \end{aligned}$ |
| 2020Q1 | 133.3 | 3.0 | 133.3 | 2.9 | 258.5 | 1.0 | 258.4 | 0.9 | 112.2 | 3.5 | 112.2 | 3.4 | 100.4 | 0.1 | 100.4 | 0.1 | 106.0 | (0.0) | 106.0 | 0.0 | 108.8 | 2.1 | 108.6 | 1.4 |
| 2020Q2 | 133.2 | (0.5) | 133.0 | (0.9) | 256.5 | (3.1) | 255.8 | (4.0) | 111.2 | (3.3) | 111.1 | (3.7) | 100.1 | (1.2) | 100.1 | (1.3) | 105.8 | (0.5) | 105.6 | (1.5) | 108.5 | (1.3) | 108.2 | (1.7) |
| 2020Q3 | 134.4 | 3.7 | 133.0 | 0.0 | 259.4 | 4.7 | 255.7 | (0.1) | 111.8 | 1.9 | 110.1 | (3.5) | 100.0 | (0.4) | 99.8 | (1.2) | 105.7 | (0.6) | 104.6 | (3.8) | 108.9 | 1.5 | 107.8 | (1.2) |
| 2020Q4 | 135.4 | 3.1 | 132.9 | (0.2) | 261.0 | 2.4 | 255.4 | (0.5) | 111.2 | (2.2) | 107.9 | (7.8) | 99.5 | (1.9) | 98.9 | (3.5) | 105.9 | 1.0 | 103.9 | (2.4) | 108.9 | 0.3 | 107.5 | (1.3) |
| 2021Q1 | 137.2 | 5.4 | 133.7 | 2.4 | 263.4 | 3.7 | 256.3 | 1.4 | 112.1 | 3.3 | 107.2 | (2.6) | 99.9 | 1.5 | 98.8 | (0.3) | 107.2 | 4.9 | 104.5 | 2.1 | 109.4 | 1.9 | 107.8 | 1.0 |
| 2021Q2 | 139.2 | 5.8 | 134.9 | 3.6 | 268.8 | 8.4 | 260.3 | 6.4 | 112.5 | 1.5 | 106.3 | (3.5) | 99.3 | (2.2) | 97.9 | (3.6) | 108.2 | 3.7 | 105.2 | 2.9 | 110.6 | 4.4 | 108.8 | 4.1 |
| 2021 Q 3 | 141.1 | 5.7 | 136.5 | 4.8 | 273.1 | 6.6 | 263.8 | 5.5 | 112.7 | 0.8 | 105.9 | (1.2) | 99.8 | 1.8 | 98.1 | 0.8 | 109.8 | 6.3 | 106.8 | 6.1 | 111.9 | 4.5 | 110.2 | 4.9 |
| 2021Q4 | 143.6 | 7.4 | 138.8 | 6.9 | 278.6 | 8.2 | 268.6 | 7.4 | 113.1 | 1.5 | 106.0 | 0.2 | 100.0 | 1.1 | 98.2 | 0.4 | 111.3 | 5.4 | 108.1 | 5.0 | 114.3 | 8.9 | 112.6 | 9.0 |
| 2022Q1 | 145.6 | 5.6 | 140.6 | 5.3 | 281.8 | 4.6 | 271.3 | 4.1 | 113.8 | 2.6 | 106.5 | 2.0 | 100.3 | 1.2 | 98.4 | 0.6 | 112.6 | 4.8 | 109.4 | 4.7 | 115.7 | 5.1 | 114.0 | 5.1 |
| 2022Q2 | 147.1 | 4.2 | 142.0 | 4.2 | 284.1 | 3.3 | 273.6 | 3.4 | 114.7 | 2.9 | 107.4 | 3.3 | 100.5 | 0.8 | 98.4 | 0.3 | 113.4 | 2.7 | 110.1 | 2.6 | 118.2 | 8.9 | 116.4 | 9.0 |
| 2022Q3 | 148.3 | 3.4 | 143.3 | 3.5 | 286.0 | 2.7 | 275.4 | 2.7 | 115.5 | 2.9 | 108.6 | 4.5 | 100.7 | 0.8 | 98.5 | 0.3 | 114.0 | 2.4 | 110.6 | 2.2 | 119.4 | 4.1 | 117.6 | 4.1 |
| 2022Q4 | 149.5 | 3.1 | 144.4 | 3.2 | 287.7 | 2.5 | 276.9 | 2.3 | 116.4 | 3.1 | 109.9 | 5.0 | 100.9 | 0.8 | 98.6 | 0.4 | 114.4 | 1.1 | 110.9 | 0.9 | 120.3 | 3.3 | 118.5 | 3.3 |
| 2023 Q 1 | 150.6 | 3.0 | 145.5 | 3.1 | 289.4 | 2.3 | 278.3 | 2.0 | 117.4 | 3.5 | 111.3 | 5.1 | 101.1 | 0.6 | 98.6 | 0.2 | 114.9 | 1.7 | 111.3 | 1.4 | 121.0 | 2.2 | 119.2 | 2.2 |
| 2023Q2 | 151.7 | 2.9 | 146.6 | 2.9 | 290.9 | 2.2 | 279.6 | 1.8 | 118.5 | 3.7 | 112.7 | 5.0 | 101.2 | 0.6 | 98.7 | 0.1 | 115.1 | 1.0 | 111.4 | 0.6 | 121.7 | 2.2 | 119.8 | 2.2 |
| 2023Q3 | 152.8 | 3.0 | 147.6 | 2.9 | 292.6 | 2.3 | 280.8 | 1.8 | 119.6 | 3.8 | 113.9 | 4.5 | 101.4 | 0.6 | 98.7 | 0.1 | 115.4 | 1.0 | 111.6 | 0.5 | 122.2 | 1.9 | 120.4 | 1.9 |
| 2023Q4 | 153.9 | 2.9 | 148.6 | 2.8 | 294.2 | 2.3 | 282.0 | 1.8 | 120.7 | 3.7 | 115.1 | 4.1 | 101.5 | 0.5 | 98.7 | 0.1 | 115.7 | 1.1 | 111.7 | 0.5 | 122.8 | 1.9 | 121.0 | 1.8 |
| 2024 Q 1 | 155.0 | 2.9 | 149.6 | 2.8 | 295.8 | 2.1 | 283.3 | 1.8 | 121.7 | 3.5 | 116.1 | 3.8 | 101.6 | 0.5 | 98.7 | 0.1 | 116.1 | 1.2 | 111.9 | 0.7 | 123.4 | 2.0 | 121.5 | 1.9 |
| 2024Q2 | 156.1 | 3.0 | 150.6 | 2.7 | 297.5 | 2.3 | 284.5 | 1.8 | 122.7 | 3.3 | 117.1 | 3.4 | 101.8 | 0.5 | 98.7 | 0.1 | 116.5 | 1.4 | 112.1 | 0.8 | 124.0 | 2.0 | 122.1 | 1.8 |
| 2024Q3 | 157.2 | 2.9 | 151.6 | 2.6 | 299.2 | 2.3 | 285.7 | 1.8 | 123.7 | 3.3 | 118.0 | 3.2 | 101.9 | 0.6 | 98.8 | 0.0 | 116.9 | 1.5 | 112.4 | 0.9 | 124.7 | 2.1 | 122.7 | 1.9 |
| 2024Q4 | 158.4 | 2.9 | 152.5 | 2.5 | 300.9 | 2.3 | 287.0 | 1.8 | 124.7 | 3.2 | 119.0 | 3.1 | 102.1 | 0.6 | 98.8 | (0.0) | 117.4 | 1.6 | 112.6 | 1.0 | 125.3 | 2.1 | 123.2 | 1.9 |
| 2025Q1 | 159.5 | 2.9 | 153.5 | 2.5 | 302.6 | 2.3 | 288.3 | 1.8 | 125.7 | 3.2 | 119.9 | 3.0 | 102.2 | 0.6 | 98.7 | (0.0) | 117.9 | 1.7 | 112.9 | 1.0 | 126.0 | 2.1 | 123.8 | 1.9 |
| 2025Q2 | 160.6 | 2.9 | 154.4 | 2.5 | 304.4 | 2.3 | 289.7 | 1.9 | 126.6 | 3.1 | 120.7 | 3.0 | 102.3 | 0.6 | 98.7 | (0.1) | 118.4 | 1.8 | 113.2 | 1.1 | 126.6 | 2.1 | 124.4 | 1.8 |
| 2025Q3 | 161.8 | 2.9 | 155.4 | 2.5 | 306.2 | 2.4 | 291.1 | 2.0 | 127.6 | 3.1 | 121.6 | 3.0 | 102.5 | 0.6 | 98.7 | (0.1) | 119.0 | 1.9 | 113.6 | 1.2 | 127.3 | 2.1 | 124.9 | 1.8 |
| 2025Q4 | 162.9 | 2.8 | 156.4 | 2.5 | 307.9 | 2.4 | 292.6 | 2.1 | 128.6 | 3.0 | 122.5 | 2.9 | 102.6 | 0.6 | 98.7 | (0.1) | 119.5 | 1.9 | 113.9 | 1.2 | 127.9 | 2.0 | 125.5 | 1.8 |

[^5]Table 5: Macroeconomic Impact of Government Pandemic Aid in 10 Largest Economies (Cont'd)









 $\dot{\Delta} \dot{\sim}$
110.1
2




2020

Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics


#### Abstract

About the Authors Bernard Yaros is an assistant director and economist at Moody's Analytics focused primarily on federal fiscal policy He is responsible for maintaining the Moody's Analytics forecast models for federal government fiscal conditions and presidential elections, as well as providing real-time economic analysis on fiscal policy developments coming out of Capitol Hill. Besides fiscal policy, Bernard covers the District of Columbia and Puerto Rico and develops forecasts for Switzerland.

Bernard holds an MSc in international trade, finance and development from the Barcelona Graduate School of Economics and a BA in political economy from Williams College.

Jesse Rogers is an economist at Moody's Analytics covering Latin America and Emerging Asia. His research spans trade policy, international capital flows, commodity markets, and economic development. Jesse holds a master's degree in economics and international relations from the Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies. While completing his degree, he interned with the U.S. Treasury and Institute of International Finance. Previously, he was a finance and politics reporter for El Diario New York and worked in Mexico City for the Center for Research and Teaching in economics (CIDE). He received his bachelor's degree in Hispanic studies at the University of Pennsylvania.


Ross Cioffi is an associate economist at the Moody's Analytics Prague office. He is responsible for forecasting and providing research and analysis on key European economies. Ross holds a master's degree in international economics from the Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies. He also has a master's degree in international relations from the University of Bologna. Prior to joining Moody's Analytics, Ross was a research assistant in the Economic Research Department of the Central Bank of Luxembourg.

Mark Zandi is chief economist of Moody's Analytics, where he directs economic research. Moody's Analytics, a subsidiary of Moody's Corp., is a leading provider of economic research, data and analytical tools. Dr. Zandi is a cofounder of Economy.com, which Moody's purchased in 2005.

Dr. Zandi's broad research interests encompass macroeconomics, financial markets and public policy. His recent research has focused on mortgage finance reform and the determinants of mortgage foreclosure and personal bankruptcy. He has analyzed the economic impact of various tax and government spending policies and assessed the appropriate monetary policy response to bubbles in asset markets.
A trusted adviser to policymakers and an influential source of economic analysis for businesses, journalists and the public, Dr. Zandi frequently testifies before Congress on topics including the economic outlook, the nation's daunting fiscal challenges, the merits of fiscal stimulus, financial regulatory reform, and foreclosure mitigation.
Dr. Zandi conducts regular briefings on the economy for corporate boards, trade associations and policymakers at all levels. He is on the board of directors of MGIC, the nation's largest private mortgage insurance company, and The Reinvestment Fund, a large CDFI that makes investments in disadvantaged neighborhoods. He is often quoted in national and global publications and interviewed by major news media outlets, and is a frequent guest on CNBC, NPR, Meet the Press, CNN, and various other national networks and news programs.

Dr. Zandi is the author of Paying the Price: Ending the Great Recession and Beginning a New American Century, which provides an assessment of the monetary and fiscal policy response to the Great Recession. His other book, Financial Shock: A 360ㄴook at the Subprime Mortgage Implosion, and How to Avoid the Next Financial Crisis, is described by The New York Times as the "clearest guide" to the financial crisis.
Dr. Zandi earned his BS from the Wharton School at the University of Pennsylvania and his PhD at the University of Pennsylvania. He lives with his wife and three children in the suburbs of Philadelphia.

## About Moody's Analytics

Moody's Analytics provides financial intelligence and analytical tools supporting our clients' growth, efficiency and risk management objectives. The combination of our unparalleled expertise in risk, expansive information resources, and innovative application of technology helps today's business leaders confidently navigate an evolving marketplace. We are recognized for our industry-leading solutions, comprising research, data, software and professional services, assembled to deliver a seamless customer experience. Thousands of organizations worldwide have made us their trusted partner because of our uncompromising commitment to quality, client service, and integrity.

Concise and timely economic research by Moody's Analytics supports firms and policymakers in strategic planning, product and sales forecasting, credit risk and sensitivity management, and investment research. Our economic research publications provide in-depth analysis of the global economy, including the U.S. and all of its state and metropolitan areas, all European countries and their subnational areas, Asia, and the Americas. We track and forecast economic growth and cover specialized topics such as labor markets, housing, consumer spending and credit, output and income, mortgage activity, demographics, central bank behavior, and prices. We also provide real-time monitoring of macroeconomic indicators and analysis on timely topics such as monetary policy and sovereign risk. Our clients include multinational corporations, governments at all levels, central banks, financial regulators, retailers, mutual funds, financial institutions, utilities, residential and commercial real estate firms, insurance companies, and professional investors.

Moody's Analytics added the economic forecasting firm Economy.com to its portfolio in 2005. This unit is based in West Chester PA, a suburb of Philadelphia, with offices in London, Prague and Sydney. More information is available at www.economy.com.

Moody's Analytics is a subsidiary of Moody's Corporation (NYSE: MCO). Further information is available at www.moodysanalytics.com.

DISCLAIMER: Moody's Analytics, a unit of Moody's Corporation, provides economic analysis, credit risk data and insight, as well as risk management solutions. Research authored by Moody's Analytics does not reflect the opinions of Moody's Investors Service, the credit rating agency. To avoid confusion, please use the full company name "Moody's Analytics", when citing views from Moody's Analytics.

## About Moody's Corporation

Moody's Analytics is a subsidiary of Moody's Corporation (NYSE: MCO). MCO reported revenue of $\$ 5.4$ billion in 2020, employs more than 11,400 people worldwide and maintains a presence in more than 40 countries. Further information about Moody's Analytics is available at www.moodysanalytics.com.
© 2022 Moody's Corporation, Moody's Investors Service, Inc., Moody's Analytics, Inc. and/or their licensors and affiliates (collectively, "MOODY'S"). All rights reserved.
CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS AFFILIATES ARE THEIR CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES, AND MATERIALS, PRODUCTS, SERVICES AND INFORMATION PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S (COLLECTIVELY, "PUBLICATIONS") MAY INCLUDE SUCH CURRENT OPINIONS. MOODY'S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT OR IMPAIRMENT. SEE APPLICABLE MOODY'S RATING SYMBOLS AND DEFINITIONS PUBLICATION FOR INFORMATION ON THE TYPES OF CONTRACTUAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS ADDRESSED BY MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS, NON-CREDIT ASSESSMENTS ("ASSESSMENTS"), AND OTHER OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS, INC. AND/OR ITS AFFILIATES. MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS DO NOT COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR. MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS AND OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLISHES ITS PUBLICATIONS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.
MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS, AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS AND INAPPROPRIATE FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO USE MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS OR PUBLICATIONS WHEN MAKING AN INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.
ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.
MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS, ASSESSMENTS, OTHER OPINIONS AND PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY ANY PERSON AS A BENCHMARK AS THAT TERM IS DEFINED FOR REGULATORY PURPOSES AND MUST NOT BE USED IN ANY WAY THAT COULD RESULT IN THEM BEING CONSIDERED A BENCHMARK.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing its Publications.
To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.
To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity, including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.
NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY CREDIT RATING, ASSESSMENT, OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.
Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any credit rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for credit ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from $\$ 1,000$ to approximately $\$ 5,000,000$. MCO and Moody's Investors Service also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of Moody's Investors Service credit ratings and credit rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold credit ratings from Moody's Investors Service and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5\%, is posted annually at www.moodys.com under the heading "Investor Relations - Corporate Governance - Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."
Additional terms for Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61003399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94105136972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail investors.
Additional terms for Japan only: Moody's Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.
MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any credit rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for credit ratings opinions and services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY100,000 to approximately JPY550,000,000.
MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.


[^0]:    1 This is known as hysteresis, which is a reduction in the economy's potential due to a significant economic shock such as a pandemic. This occurs because of the large number of business failures and bankruptcies, permanent job loss, credit problems, and reduced mobility of labor and capital. Once hysteresis sets in, it is difficult to reverse. Hysteresis effects are built into the Moody's Analytics model of the global economy.

[^1]:    2 This analysis is based on the February 2022 vintage of the Moody's Analytics global macroeconomic forecasts.
    3 A central bank's reaction function is the estimated historical relationship between the bank's monetary policy and the economic, financial and other variables that monetary authorities use to set monetary policy.
    4 Fiscal legislation that broadly seeks to invest in an economy's long-run potential was excluded. Some examples are the Build Back Better agenda in the U.S. and the Recovery and Resilience Facility in Europe. We even left out a handful of measures from pandemic-era legislation in Japan that were not explicitly tied to the virus. Additionally, our analysis includes only fiscal measures that have a direct impact on budget deficits. Liquidity supports, which were substantial in many countries, for example, were excluded.

[^2]:    5 N. Girouard and C. André (2005), "Measuring Cyclically-adjusted Budget Balances for OECD Countries," OECD Economics Department Working Papers, No. 434, OECD Publishing, Paris, https://read.oecd-ilibrary.org/economics/measuring-cyclically-adjusted-budget-balanc-es-for-oecd-countries_787626008442. M. Dolls, C. Fuest and A. Peichl (2012), "Automatic stabilizers and economic crisis: US vs. Europe," Journal of Public Economics, Elsevier, Vol. 96(3), https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0047272711001642.
    6 U.S. discretionary fiscal support during the financial crisis, including the Recovery Act that was passed into law in February 2009 and some modest additional support, totaled less than $10 \%$ of U.S. GDP.
    7 See "Blinder and Zandi: Policy Responses to Great Recession a Resounding Success," white paper for Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, October 2015.

[^3]:    8 We estimate the full-employment unemployment rate, or nonaccelerating inflation rate of unemployment, at 3.5\%.
    9 Wages as measured by the Bureau of Labor Statistics' Employment Cost Index.

[^4]:    Sources: Government of India's Ministry of Finance, National People's Congress, Tesouro Nacional, Moody's Analytics

[^5]:    
    
    
    
    
    

    तِ $\stackrel{\infty}{\alpha}(\underset{\alpha}{\circ}$
    
    
    
    
    
    
    $\underset{\sim}{\sim}$
    

    Sources: National statistical agencies, Moody's Analytics

